

SENSE OF PLACE - DEFENSE OF PLACE

A CASE STUDY OF THE TORONTO ISLAND

by

SARAH DUANE SATTERTHWAITE GIBSON

Department of Geography

A Thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements  
for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the  
University of Toronto

© Sarah Duane Satterthwaite Gibson 1981

## ABSTRACT

This thesis investigates the dialectical relationship between sense of place (i.e., feeling of belonging in and having a deep emotional attachment to a place of personal significance and meaning) and defense of place (i.e., specific political, legal and other actions taken to protect a place that is threatened). That is to say, when a place to which a person or a group of people is strongly attached is threatened in some way, the sense of place may lead to and condition the nature of the defense of place; and, when a place is threatened and defended, that defense of place, in turn, conditions and influences the nature of sense of place. In this dialectical relationship between sense of place and defense of place, the concept of threat occupies a position of central importance as a catalyst to action and a continuing influence.

The phenomenon of sense of place may exist in the absence of a severe threat or any defense of place. But when defense of place is evident, sense of place is the foundation upon which that defense of place is built. Sense of place, therefore, is given a position of primary importance in this investigation. It is argued that sense of place is a subjective phenomenon and, based on the information collected for this study, that it is composed of six, inter-related major components which have been termed: sense of history, sense of identity, sense of community, sense of environment, sense of control and sense of change.

Because of the nature of sense of place, this study adopts, as much as possible, an experiential perspective - i.e., attempts to under-

stand the phenomena of sense of place and defense of place from the perspective of the experiencing individuals, using their own words and actions as clues to how they relate to their particular place. In addition, in order to explore the complex, holistic, multi-faceted nature of sense of place and its relation to defense of place, this study presents a detailed, case study of a particular group of individuals (Toronto Islanders) and how they have related to a particular place (Toronto Island), which has been subjected to a variety of threats over a long period of time. In order to accomplish these ends, a variety of data sources and techniques were employed, most notably a lengthy period of participant observation (which involved living on the Island for approximately four months and extensive visiting over a period of six years) and interviewing of both Islanders (over eighty hours of taped interviews) and politicians (over twenty hours of taped interviews). In addition, analysis of the voluminous documentary records was conducted.

Evidence is presented that Toronto Islanders have experienced a sense of place and have repeatedly defended their special place against outside threats to radically alter or destroy it. By devoting one chapter to each of the six major components of sense of place, this study defines each component, provides copious evidence that Toronto Islanders have experienced each component, analyzes the Island and Islanders in terms of each component and analyzes the dialectical links between each component and defense of place. This study, therefore, also demonstrates (by constant reference to detailed observations and comments from individual Islanders) how each general component of sense of place may be applied and analyzed in a particular place and may serve as a guide to future studies.

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	iii
Lists of Maps and Illustrations	v
 <u>CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION</u>	
i. Sense of Place - Defense of Place: An Overview	1
ii. Introduction to Sense of Place	4
a. Definition of Sense of Place	5
b. Subjective Nature of Sense of Place	7
c. Modes of Experience	9
d. Time and Place	11
e. Case Study Approach	14
f. Toronto Islanders' Sense of Place	15
g. Components of Sense of Place	24
h. Sense of Place: Motivation For Defense of Place	36
iii. Introduction to Defense of Place	36
a. Definition of Defense of Place	36
b. Threat	38
c. Toronto Islanders' Defense of Place	41
iv. Introduction to the Toronto Island	46
a. Torontonians' Fascination With the Toronto Island	46
b. Brief History and Description	47
c. Social Profile	60
 <u>CHAPTER 2. METHODS AND APPROACH</u>	
i. Introduction	64
ii. Initial Contact With the Toronto Island	70
iii. Participant Observation	75
a. Description	78
b. Entry	81
c. Overt Versus Covert Research	82
d. Role	85
e. Informants	88
f. Sources of Stress	90
iv. Interviews	92
a. Interviews With Islanders	93
b. Interviews With Politicians	96
c. Representativeness	97
d. "Truthfulness" and "Accuracy"	101
v. Document Analysis	103
vi. Ethical Considerations	105
a. Anonymity	106
b. Morale	107
c. "Conduit Problem"	107
d. Political Consequences	108

	<u>Page</u>
<u>CHAPTER 3. SENSE OF HISTORY</u>	
i. Analysis of Sense of History	110
ii. Historical Context	115
a. The Early Days	115
b. Development of the Peninsula	118
c. Toronto Island: 1860-1900	120
d. Toronto Island: 1900-1930	128
e. Toronto Island: 1930-1950	137
f. Toronto Island: 1950-1970	144
iii. Sense of History - Defense of Place	152
a. Impact of Islanders' Sense of History on Their Defense of Place	152
b. The Politicians' Response	157
c. Impact of Islanders' Defense of Place on Their Sense of History	158
 <u>CHAPTER 4. SENSE OF IDENTITY</u>	
i. Analysis of Sense of Identity	160
a. Introduction	160
b. Boundaries, Visibility and Contrast	168
c. Island Houses	171
d. Island Neighbourhood	176
e. Personal History and Association With Place	178
f. Group Identity	180
ii. Sense of Identity - Defense of Place	181
 <u>CHAPTER 5. SENSE OF COMMUNITY</u>	
i. Analysis of Sense of Community	186
a. Introduction	186
b. Community Life - Brief Description	196
c. Boundaries	197
d. Isolation	198
e. Inconveniences	199
f. The Boat and Other Public Meeting Places	199
g. Seasonal Rhythms	201
1. General	201
2. Winter	201
h. Cars and Social Life	202
i. Some Community Values	203
1. Individuality and Tolerance	204
2. Self-Reliance	205
3. "Out-of-the-Mainstream"	205
4. Anti-Commercialism and Anti-Materialism	206
5. "Scavenger Society"	207
6. "Lifestyle Over Workstyle"	208
7. Social Mix	208
j. Ward's and Algonquin: Social Images	210
1. Inter-Island Images	210
2. Intra-Island Images	212
3. Summer Residents	213
k. Big City - Small Town: Social Images	215
1. City Images	216
2. Small Town Images	216
1. Suburbia: Social Images	218

	<u>Page</u>
ii. Sense of Community - Defense of Place	219
a. Impact of Islanders' Sense of Community on Their Defense of Place	219
1. Direct Appeal Based on Community Arguments	219
2. Refusal To Split the Community	227
3. Social Mix	230
4. Suburbia	238
5. Foundation for 1974 Spring Campaign	239
b. Politicians' Responses	240
c. Impact of Islanders' Defense of Place on Their Sense of Community	246
<u>CHAPTER 6. SENSE OF ENVIRONMENT</u>	
i. Analysis of Sense of Environment	252
a. Introduction	252
b. Island Sights - General	263
c. Island Sounds	264
d. Island Smells	265
e. Water	266
f. Sky	267
g. Spaciousness	268
h. Storms	269
i. Wildlife	269
j. Night	270
k. Seasons	270
l. Carless Environment	273
m. Scale	274
n. Ward's and Algonquin: Physical Images	274
o. Urban Proximity - Pastoral Retreat	276
p. Suburbia: Physical Images	278
q. Naming	279
r. "Hidden Landscapes"	280
s. Children	281
1. Memories of Growing Up	281
2. Children's Sense of Environment	282
ii. Sense of Environment - Defense of Place	284
a. Impact of Islanders' Sense of Environment on Their Defense of Place	284
1. "Protectors" of the Island Environment	285
2. The Car Controversy	287
3. "Islandness"	291
4. Insularity: Physical and Political	292
b. Politicians' Responses	294
1. Conflicting Images: Parkland <u>Manqué</u> vs. Well-Established Community	294
2. Conflicting Park Philosophies: "Pure Park" vs. Mixed Use	296
3. Island Tours	300
4. The Subsidy Argument	303
5. Separateness	305
c. Impact of Islanders' Defense of Place on Their Sense of Environment	306
1. Deliberately Reinforcing a Sense of Environment	307
2. Suburban Contrast	307

	<u>Page</u>
<u>CHAPTER 7. SENSE OF CONTROL</u>	
i. Analysis of Sense of Control	311
a. Introduction	311
b. Island Houses	316
c. Inconveniences	322
d. Reactions to a Housing Cooperative	326
e. Community Control	333
ii. Sense of Control - Defense of Place	336
a. Impact of Islanders' Sense of Control on Their Defense of Place	336
1. General Approach	336
2. Homeownership: INPHA and the Crombie Motion	337
3. Spring Campaign Organization	339
b. Impact of Islanders' Defense of Place on Their Sense of Control	340
1. Attitudes Toward Authority, Politics and Politicians	340
2. Gaining Control: Successes and Failures	344
3. Paradox of Control	349

#### CHAPTER 8. SENSE OF CHANGE

i. Analysis of Sense of Change	351
a. Introduction	351
b. Community Under Siege	361
c. Other Effects of Threat and Uncertainty	366
1. Housing Conditions	366
2. Human Costs	369
d. Coping With Uncertainty and Stress	373
1. Moving	373
2. Buying a House	379
3. Attitudes	380
e. Children	385
ii. Sense of Change - Defense of Place	388
a. General Motivation	388
b. Threat and Defense of Place	393
c. Making Threatened Change Visible	395

#### CHAPTER 9. CONCLUSION

i. Methods and Approach	399
ii. Sense of Place	403
iii. Sense of Place - Defense of Place	422
iv. Approach to Planning and Development	446

#### APPENDICES

APPENDIX A - EXAMPLES OF SENSE OF PLACE	
APPENDIX B - CHRONOLOGY	
APPENDIX C - ISLAND VISITS	
APPENDIX D - ISLANDERS' INTERVIEWS: SAMPLE QUESTIONS	
APPENDIX E - POLITICIANS' INTERVIEWS: SAMPLE QUESTIONS	
APPENDIX F - FERRY STATISTICS	
APPENDIX G - PROBLEMS IN ESTIMATING ISLAND POPULATION	
APPENDIX H - TORONTO ISLAND SCHOOL ATTENDANCE STATISTICS	
APPENDIX I - DEMOLITION OF ISLAND PROPERTIES	
APPENDIX J - PUBLIC SUPPORT: MAY 1974 BY MCIC	

#### SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the course of preparing this thesis, I have received a great deal of help from a large number of people and institutions, and I would like to thank them here.

On the academic front:

Howard Andrews, my supervisor, for giving sage advice, wielding a sharp red pencil and especially for having the patience and persistence to stick with both the project and me;

Alan Baker, for providing much needed moral support throughout the long process;

Jim Lemon, for providing a different perspective;

Larry Bourne, Roger Hart, John Hitchcock, Ted Relph and Anne Whyte for offering valuable comments and criticisms at various stages of the work.

On the administrative front:

Zehra Alpar, for keeping me administratively correct;

Elinor Burt, for spending long hours typing this document.

On the institutional front:

The Canada Council, for providing financial support for two of the years during which this project was in progress;

The City of Toronto Archives staff and David Crombie of the Metro Toronto Clerk's Department, for dusting off dozens of volumes of City and Metro Minutes and digging various and sundry items out of dark corners;

Peter Holt of the Toronto Island Archives (who might blanch at being referred to as an "institution"), for helping to provide illustrations;

The Toronto Globe and Mail library, for allowing me to pore over its newspaper files;

The Baldwin Room of the Metropolitan Toronto Library;

The Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library;

The Toronto Board of Education Archive;

Edward Phelps of the University of Western Ontario Map Library.

On the Mainland political front:

The various politicians whom I interviewed, for taking the time to sit down to discuss the Island with me.

On the domestic front:

Wendy Bass, for giving me peace of mind and my children wonderful care;

My brother Frank (Meg and Katie's Uncle Frank) for giving academic advice and, especially, for giving direct practical help as our "au pair boy" during a critical phase of the work;

Doug, for giving much needed encouragement and unfailing moral support, and for putting up with me and my exaggerated moods during a much longer period than either of us expected this project to take;

Meg and Katie, for being themselves--without them this dissertation would have been completed much sooner, but life would have been much poorer.

On the Island front:

Finally, and especially, the Islanders, whose fight to remain on the Island provided the inspiration for this thesis and whose perceptions, articulateness, openness, wit and numerous cups of tea (as well as other beverages) made researching "their Island" a pleasurable as well as a rewarding experience. I can't begin to list you individually, but let me thank you collectively. I hope that you recognize yourselves and your Island in the pages of this thesis.

Naturally, while I received much assistance from other people, I must take responsibility for any errors that have crept into this document (unless, of course, anyone else wishes to come forward and take credit).

MAPS

	<u>After Page</u>
Map 1 Toronto Island 1972	47
Map 2 Ward's and Algonquin Islands 1973	54
Map 3 Plan of York Harbour by A. Aitkin 1793	115
Map 4 Plan of the Harbour, Fort and Town of York March 16, 1816	116
Map 5 From: Map of the Township of York by J.D. Browne 1851	119
Map 6 Plan of the Island by C. Unwin, 1868 revised to 1875	121
Map 7 Island of Hiawatha, Goad's Atlas 1884	121
Map 8 Island of Hiawatha, Goad's Atlas 1890	124
Map 9 Island of Hiawatha, Goad's Atlas 1890 revised to 1903	130
Map 10 Composite Map of Toronto Island, Goad's Atlas 1910	130
Map 11 Lakeshore Avenue and Ward's Island, Goad's Atlas 1910	130
Map 12 Plan of Toronto Island, Toronto Harbor Commissioners 1918	130
Map 13 Lakeshore Avenue and Ward's Island, Goad's Atlas 1910 revised to 1923-24	130
Map 14 Waterfront Development--Central Section, Toronto Harbor Commissioners 1912	136
Map 15 Hanlan's Point Amusement Park 1931	137
Map 16 Hanlan's Point Amusement Park 1951	137
Map 17 Manitou Road--"The Main Drag"--1931 and 1951	137
Map 18 Ward's Island 1931 and 1938	138
Map 19 Algonquin Island 1938	139
Map 20 Algonquin Island 1951	139
Map 21 City of Toronto Planning Board Proposal 1947	143
Map 22 Inter-Island Council Plan 1949	143
Map 23 Suggested Development of Toronto Island, City Planning Board and Toronto Harbor Commissioners September 1951	143
Map 24 Maycr Lamport's Plan 1953	143
Map 25 Toronto Island 1955	144

ILLUSTRATIONS

		<u>After Page</u>
Illustration 1	Dialectical Relationship of Sense of Place and Defense of Place	3
Illustration 2	Island Interviews: Summary and Comparison	94
Illustration 3	Toronto Island Lighthouse	117
Illustration 4	Privats' Hotel 185-	119
Illustration 5	Hanlan's Boathouse with Ned Hanlan 1870	121
Illustration 6	Mrs. Parkinson's (later Mead's) Hotel 1882	121
Illustration 7	Hanlan's Hotel 1874 and 1907	122
Illustration 8	The Massey House and Goad's "Floreat"	126
Illustration 9	St. Andrew's-By-The-Lake, c. 1884	126
Illustration 10	Toronto Island School 189-	127
Illustration 11	Hanlan's Point Early 1900's	129
Illustration 12	Hanlan's Point Houses Early 1900's	129
Illustration 13	Centre Island Early 1900's	130
Illustration 14	Centre Island Houses Early 1900's	130
Illustration 15	Tenting on Ward's Island Early 1900's	130
Illustration 16	High Water on Manitou Road 1947 or 1948	141
Illustration 17	Manitou Road in Winter	141
Illustration 18	Demolition	141
Illustration 19	Bulldozers at Centre Island	141
Illustration 20	Wrecking Crew on the Main Drag	141
Illustration 21	Demolitions	151
Illustration 22	Ward's Hotel Poster 1974	154
Illustration 23	Boundary and Contrast	168
Illustration 24	House as Symbol of Self	174

	<u>After Page</u>
Illustration 25 House as Symbol of Political Self	184
Illustration 26 Environmental Lifestyle	195
Illustration 27 The Ferry	199
Illustration 28 Community Political Events	247
Illustration 29 The Seasons	270
Illustration 30 Carless Streets	273
Illustration 31 Gregg's Drawing	282
Illustration 32 <u>The Goose and Duck</u> : Creating Environmental Awareness	307
Illustration 33 Making Threatened Change Visible	396
Illustration 34 Examples of Interrelationships Among the Components of Sense of Place	415
Illustration 35 1974 Spring Campaign	434